Via electronic submission: http://www.regulations.gov

Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20580

Re: Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, Federal Trade Commission; Noncompete Clause Rule; 88 Fed. Reg. 3482-3546 (January 19, 2023)

The undersigned organizations, who together represent businesses that provide goods and services to virtually every American in every corner of the country, submit these comments regarding the proposed Noncompete Rule. We strongly oppose the proposal because noncompetes serve vital business and employee interests and because the FTC lacks legal authority to issue the proposed rule.

Most importantly, noncompetes serve pro-competitive interests. Courts, scholars, and economists all have found that noncompetes encourage investment in employees and help to protect intellectual property. In every sector of the economy, employers rely on noncompetes to protect investments in their workforce, to protect trade secrets and other confidential information, and to structure their compensation programs. As the FTC's own economist John McAdams recently explained, noncompetes "allow firms to reduce recruitment and training costs by lowering turnover," encourage firms to offer higher wages to compensate new employees, and "increase the returns to research and development," thereby promoting innovation. Unfortunately, the Commission ignored or downplayed this evidence, thereby undermining "confidence in the integrity of the rulemaking process or the ultimate outcome."

Moreover, noncompetes promote pro-competitive interests far more effectively than alternatives such as trade-secret laws or nondisclosure agreements. By relying on noncompetes over nondisclosure agreements or trade-secret law, "employers avoid the difficulties of proving an actual or threatened misappropriation of trade secrets to secure an injunction," a costly and time-consuming process. Scholars have found that noncompetes "may represent a more efficient mechanism to prevent proprietary knowledge transfers in certain circumstances, particularly when monitoring and the enforcement of trade secrets law is costly."

¹ McAdams, *Non-Compete Agreements: A Review of the Literature*, Bureau of Economics Research Paper, 6 (2019), https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/ papers.cfm?abstract_id=3513639.

² Dissenting Statement of Commissioner Wilson, at https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/ftc_gov/pdf/p201000noncompetewilsondissent.pdf.

³ Michael J. Garrison & John T. Wendt, *The Evolving Law of Employee Noncompete Agreements: Recent Trends and an Alternative Policy Approach*, 45 Am. Bus. L.J. 107, 117 (2008).

⁴ Camila Ringeling, Joshua D. Wright, et. al, *Noncompete Clauses Used in Employment Contracts*, Comment of the Global Antitrust Institute 4-5, & n.7, n.9 (Feb. 7, 2020), https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3534374.

Noncompetes are also often used as part of contractual arrangements between the employer and the employee that result in additional compensation to the employee, in the form of added pay, retention bonuses, stock awards, deferred compensation or as part of a severance package. Noncompetes are also essential to the sale of a business. Businesses often have multiple owners with ownership levels beneath the 25 percent threshold recognized by the proposed rule, yet noncompetes would be banned in these instances as well. Employers often make significant investments in providing upskilling for their employees. These investments often require the employee to agree to stay with the employer for a period of time. The proposed rule fails to appropriately recognize any of these applications, all of which fail to demonstrate a clear harm to competition or harm to the employee.

In addition to the damage the proposal would inflict on businesses and employees, the FTC lacks the statutory authority under the FTC Act to issue the rule. Section 5 of the FTC Act empowers the Commission to pursue individual enforcement actions against "unfair methods of competition," and Section 6(g) provides narrow authority to develop internal procedural rules. Neither provision, nor any other, authorizes the FTC to adopt generally applicable substantive rules defining unfair methods of competition. In contrast, Congress has repeatedly granted the FTC the authority to promulgate substantive rules on "unfair or deceptive acts and practices" and other discrete topics, but has declined to authorize regulations addressing unfair methods of competition.

Without express authorization from Congress, the FTC also lacks the constitutional authority to promulgate the proposed rule. As the Supreme Court recently explained, the majorquestions doctrine requires that Congress speak clearly if it wishes to assign decisions of "vast economic and political significance" to an agency.⁵ That doctrine recognizes that "extraordinary grants of regulatory authority are rarely accomplished through modest words, vague terms, or subtle devices," even when there is a "colorable textual basis" for the agency's position.⁶ Nothing in the FTC Act shows a hint of a decision by Congress to allow the Commission to invalidate contracts affecting tens of millions of workers, particularly given that Congress itself has recently considered legislation that would regulate noncompetes.

Similarly, the proposed rule also runs afoul of the nondelegation doctrine. A statutory delegation is constitutional only so "long as Congress lays down by legislative act an intelligible principle" to cabin the agency's discretion.⁷ If the term "unfair methods of competition" is divorced from history and precedent, and if the Commission can condemn any business practice as unfair based on nothing more than "nefarious-sounding adjectives," then there is effectively no limit to what the Commission could condemn under Section 5.⁹

Finally, the proposed rule also violates bedrock principles of federalism. For centuries, noncompetes have been a matter of state law, and today, forty-seven States enforce reasonable noncompete clauses. If Congress "intends to alter the usual constitutional balance between the

⁵ See Nat'l Fed. of Indep. Bus. v. Occupational Health & Saf. Admin., 142 S. Ct. 661, 665 (2022).

⁶ West Virginia v. Envt'l Protec. Agency, 142 S. Ct. 2587, 2609 (2022).

⁷ Gundy v. United States, 139 S. Ct. 2116, 2123 (2019).

⁸ See Wilson, dissenting, at note 2.

⁹ See, e.g., A. L.A. Schechter Poultry Corp. v. United States, 295 U.S. 495, 539 (1935).

States and the Federal government," it must be "unmistakably clear," particularly when an agency's regulation would disrupt areas of "traditional state regulation." ¹¹

While there are many ways for this proposal to be narrowed, because the FTC lacks the authority to issue any regulation on this issue, it should withdraw its proposed rule, and revert to the authority granted to it by Congress to address questions of unfair methods of competition through its adjudicative function.

Sincerely,

National/Regional

ACA International

ACT | The App Association

Advanced Medical Technology Association

Aerospace Industries Association (AIA)

Alternative Investment Management

Association

American Bakers Association

American Bankers Association

American Beverage Association

American Coatings Association

American Council of Life Insurers

American Financial Services Association

American Hotel & Lodging Association

American Property Casualty Insurance

Association

American Staffing Association

American Trucking Associations

ANA - Association of National Advertisers

Associated Builders and Contractors

Associated Equipment Distributors

Associated General Contractors of America

Computer & Communications Industry

Association (CCIA)

Consumer Brands Association

Consumer Technology Association

CTIA - The Wireless Association

Direct Selling Association

Electronic Transactions Association

Federation of American Hospitals

Financial Services Institute (FSI)

FMI - The Food Industry Association

Foodservice Equipment Distributors

Association

Futures Industry Association

Heating, Air-conditioning, & Refrigeration

Distributors International

Independent Community Bankers of

America

Independent Electrical Contractors

Independent Insurance Agents & Brokers of

America (Big "I")

¹⁰ Gregory v. Ashcroft, 501 U.S. 452, 460 461 (1991).

¹¹ Metro Life Ins. Co. v. Massachusetts, 471 U.S. 724, 740 (1985).

Independent Lubricant Manufacturers Association (ILMA)

Industrial Fasteners Institute

International Franchise Association

ISSA, The Worldwide Cleaning Industry Association

Managed Funds Association (MFA)

Medical Alley

MEMA, The Vehicle Suppliers Association

Metals Service Center Institute

Mortgage Bankers Association

National Association of Benefits and

Insurance Professionals

National Association of Convenience Stores

National Association of Electrical Distributors

National Association of Manufacturers

National Association of Mutual Insurance Companies

National Association of Security Companies (NASCO)

National Association of Wholesaler-Distributors (NAW)

National Automobile Dealers Association

National Convenience Distributors

National Federation of Independent Business

National Funeral Directors Association

National Independent Automobile Dealers Association (NIADA)

National Lumber & Building Material Dealers Association

National Mining Association

National Newspaper Association

National Pest Management Association

National Propane Gas Association

National Retail Federation

National Roofing Contractors Association

National Truck Equipment Association

National Waste & Recycling Association

NCTA – The Internet & Television Association

NetChoice

North American Association of Food Equipment Manufacturers (NAFEM)

Reinsurance Association of America

Retail Industry Leaders Association

Securities Industry and Financial Markets
Association

SIFMA Asset Management Group

U.S. Chamber of Commerce

USTelecom - The Broadband Association

Western States Trucking Association

Wholesale & Specialty Insurance Association (WSIA)

Window Covering Manufacturers Association

Window Covering Safety Council

World Millwork Alliance

Alabama

Selma and Dallas County Chamber of Commerce and Tourism Information

Alaska

Alaska Chamber of Commerce

<u>Arizona</u>

Apache Junction Area Chamber of Commerce

Arizona Chamber of Commerce and Industry

Buckeye Valley Chamber of Commerce

Chandler Chamber of Commerce

Gilbert Chamber of Commerce

Glendale Chamber of Commerce

Greater Flagstaff Chamber of Commerce

Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce

Green Valley Sahuarita Chamber of Commerce & Visitor Center

Kingman Area Chamber of Commerce

Lake Havasu Area Chamber of Commerce

Nogales Santa Cruz County Chamber of Commerce

Peoria Chamber of Commerce

Queen Creek Chamber of Commerce

Southwest Valley Chamber of Commerce

Surprise Regional Chamber of Commerce

Tucson Metro Chamber of Commerce

West Valley Chamber of Commerce

Alliance

Wickenburg Chamber of Commerce

Yuma County Chamber of Commerce

Arkansas

Arkansas State Chamber of Commerce / Associated Industries of Arkansas

Little Rock Regional Chamber of Commerce

California

Brea Chamber of Commerce

Carlsbad Chamber of Commerce

Chino Valley Chamber of Commerce

Coalition of California Chambers - Orange County

El Dorado County Chamber of Commerce

Gateway Chambers Alliance

Greater Conejo Valley Chamber of

Commerce

Greater San Fernando Valley Chamber of

Commerce

La Mesa Chamber of Commerce

Laguna Niguel Chamber of Commerce

Modesto Chamber of Commerce

Norwalk Chamber of Commerce

Palm Desert Area Chamber of Commerce

Port Hueneme Chamber of Commerce

Rancho Cordova Area Chamber of

Commerce

Roseville Area Chamber of Commerce

San Juan Capistrano Chamber of Commerce

San Marcos Chamber of Commerce

Santa Barbara South Coast Chamber of

Commerce

Sherman Oaks Chamber of Commerce

Simi Valley Chamber of Commerce

Tulare Chamber of Commerce

West Ventura County Business Alliance

Colorado

Colorado BioScience Association

Colorado Chamber of Commerce

Greater Woodland Park Chamber of

Commerce

Connecticut

Connecticut Business and Industry Association

Florida

Coral Gables Chamber of Commerce Greater Boca Raton Chamber of Commerce Stuart/Martin County Chamber of Commerce

Georgia

Barrow County Chamber of Commerce

<u>Hawaii</u>

Chamber of Commerce Hawaii

<u>Idaho</u>

Boise Metro Chamber of Commerce
Cascade Chamber of Commerce
Meridian Chamber of Commerce
Pocatello-Chubbuck Chamber of Commerce

Illinois

Chicagoland Chamber of Commerce Cook County Black Chamber of Commerce Edwardsville/Glen Carbon Chamber of Commerce

Effingham County Chamber of Commerce
Garfield Park Chamber of Commerce
GLMV Chamber of Commerce
Greater Springfield Chamber of Commerce
Illinois Association of Mutual Insurance

Companies
Illinois Chamber of Commerce
Illinois Manufacturers' Association
Joliet Region Chamber of Commerce & Industry

Lombard Area Chamber of Commerce

Naperville Area Chamber of Commerce
Pekin Area Chamber of Commerce
Sauk Valley Area Chamber of Commerce
West Suburban Chamber of Commerce &
Industry

Winnetka-Northfield-Glencoe Chamber of Commerce

Indiana

Decatur Chamber of Commerce
Indiana Chamber of Commerce
South Bend Regional Chamber of
Commerce
Wayne County Area Chamber of Commerce

<u>Iowa</u>

Council Bluffs Area Chamber of Commerce

Kansas

Wichita Regional Chamber of Commerce

Kentucky

Commerce Lexington
Greater Louisville Inc. - The Metro
Chamber of Commerce
Kentucky Chamber of Commerce
Northern Kentucky Chamber of Commerce
Union County Chamber of Commerce

Louisiana

Bossier Chamber of Commerce
Central Louisiana Regional Chamber of
Commerce
Greenwood Chamber of Commerce

Maryland

Maryland Chamber of Commerce

Massachusetts

North Shore Chamber of Commerce

Michigan

Associated Builders & Contractors of Michigan

Detroit Regional Chamber of Commerce Grand Rapids Area Chamber of Commerce Holly Area Chamber of Commerce Lansing Regional Chamber of Commerce Michigan Biosciences Industry Association (MichBio)

Michigan Chamber of Commerce

Minnesota

Austin Area Chamber of Commerce Greater Stillwater Chamber of Commerce Lonsdale Area Chamber of Comme Marshall Area Chamber of Commerce Minnesota Chamber of Commerce Shakopee Chamber and Visitors Bureau

Missouri

Missouri Chamber of Commerce and Industry

Montana

Billings Chamber of Commerce Helena Area Chamber of Commerce Kalispell Chamber of Commerce Montana Chamber of Commerce

<u>Nebraska</u>

Broken Bow Chamber of Commerce Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce Kearney Area Chamber of Commerce Lincoln Chamber of Commerce Nebraska Chamber of Commerce & Industry

Nevada

Carson City Chamber of Commerce Henderson Chamber of Commerce Reno + Sparks Chamber of Commerce Vegas Chamber of Commerce

New Jersey

Chamber of Commerce Southern New Jersey Greater Westfield Area Chamber of Commerce (GWACC) HealthCare Institute of New Jersey (HINJ) New Jersey Civil Justice Institute

New Mexico

Greater Las Cruces Chamber of Commerce New Mexico Business Coalition

New York

Business Council of New York State Capital Region Chamber of Commerce North Country Chamber of Commerce

North Carolina

NC Chamber

North Dakota

Chamber Grand Forks / East Grand Forks

Ohio

Chillicothe Ross Chamber of Commerce Cincinnati USA Regional Chamber Dayton Area Chamber of Commerce Ohio Chamber of Commerce Toledo Regional Chamber of Commerce Union County Chamber of Commerce

Oklahoma

Greater Oklahoma City Chamber State Chamber of Oklahoma

Oregon

of Commerce
Oregon Business & Industry
Oregon State Chamber of Commerce
Springfield Area Chamber of Commerce

Grants Pass & Josephine County Chamber

Pennsylvania

Alle Kiski Strong Chamber of Commerce Cambria Regional Chamber of Commerce Carlisle Area Chamber of Commerce Chester County Chamber of Business and Industry

Greater Latrobe Laurel Valley Chamber of Commerce

Hanover Area Chamber of Commerce

Harrisburg Regional Chamber of Commerce

Indian Valley Chamber of Commerce

Lancaster Chamber of Commerce

Mechanicsburg Chamber of Commerce

Pennsylvania Chamber of Business and

Industry

Pennsylvania Food Merchants Association

Peters Township Chamber of Commerce

Pittsburgh Airport Area Chamber of

Commerce

Schuylkill Chamber of Commerce

Somerset County Chamber of Commerce

South West Regional Chamber of

Commerce

Westmoreland County Chamber of

Commerce

Rhode Island

Greater Newport Chamber of Commerce

South Carolina

Anderson Area Chamber of Commerce Berkeley County Chamber of Commerce Charleston Metro Chamber of Commerce South Carolina Chamber of Commerce

Tennessee

Kingsport Chamber of Commerce

Texas

Del Rio Chamber Of Commerce
Fort Worth Chamber of Commerce

Greater Irving-Las Colinas Chamber of Commerce

Greater Waco Chamber of Commerce

League City Regional Chamber of Commerce

Longview Chamber of Commerce

North Texas Commission

Rowlett Area Chamber & Visitors Center

Sherman Chamber of Commerce

Texas Association of Business

<u>Utah</u>

Cache Valley Chamber of Commerce

ChamberWest

Payson Santaquin Area Chamber of

Commerce

South Valley Chamber of Commerce

St. George Area Chamber of Commerce

<u>Virginia</u>

Blackstone Chamber of Commerce

Central Fairfax Chamber of Commerce

Roanoke Regional Chamber of Commerce

Virginia Chamber of Commerce

Washington

Association of Washington Business

Auburn Area Chamber of Commerce

Greater Grays Harbor, Inc.

Greater Yakima Chamber of Commerce

Mercer Island Chamber of Commerce

Moses Lake Chamber of Commerce

Puyallup Sumner Chamber of Commerce

Shelton-Mason County Chamber of Commerce

South Kitsap Chamber of Commerce

Washington Retail Association

West Plains Chamber of Commerce

West Virginia

West Virginia Chamber of Commerce

West Virginia Manufacturers Association

Wisconsin

Metropolitan Milwaukee Association of Commerce

Wisconsin Manufacturers and Commerce

Wyoming

Greater Cheyenne Chamber of Commerce
Jackson Hole Chamber of Commerce